

Comparative Legal Perspectives on Halal Tourism Regulations in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria

Hendri Hermawan Adinugraha^{1*}, Muhammad Khoirul Fikri¹, Asep Suraya Maulana¹, Zohaib Hassan Sain², Uthman Shehu Lawal³

¹ Universitas Islam Negeri K.H. Abdurrahman Wahid Pekalongan, Indonesia

² Superior University, Pakistan

³ Kaduna State University, Nigeria

*Corresponding Author: hendri.hermawan@uingusdur.ac.id

Abstract: Disharmony in halal tourism regulations in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria has generated variations in service standards, weak legal certainty, and governance inconsistencies that hinder the competitiveness of halal destinations. This study aims to analyze and compare the regulatory frameworks of halal tourism in the three countries by examining the characteristics of their legal systems, institutional capacities, and the implications for service consistency and industry development. A literature-based qualitative method was employed by reviewing laws, government policies, institutional documents, and academic literature related to halal governance. Content analysis and comparative analysis were applied to identify patterns of similarities, differences, and the effectiveness of regulatory frameworks. The findings reveal that Indonesia demonstrates a more integrated halal regulatory structure through BPJPH and MUI, Pakistan relies on a market-driven mechanism due to the absence of formal regulation in the halal tourism sector, while Nigeria shows fragmented regulation caused by its federal structure and dual legal system, resulting in non-uniform halal service standards across regions. The results underscore that regulatory effectiveness is strongly linked to the configuration of a country's legal system and governance capacity. This study enriches the scholarly discourse by offering a comprehensive comparative legal analysis that provides a conceptual basis for regulatory harmonization to strengthen the global halal tourism industry.

Keywords: Sharia economics, comparative law, halal tourism, regulation, governance.

Received: September 18, 2025

Accepted: November 30, 2025

Published: November 30, 2025

To Cite this Article: Adinugraha, Hendri Hermawan, Muhammad Khoirul Fikri, Asep Suraya Maulana, Zohaib Hassan Sain, and Uthman Shehu Lawal. "Comparative Legal Perspectives on Halal Tourism Regulations in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria." *Abdurrauf Law and Sharia* 2, no. 2 (2025): 212-239. <https://doi.org/10.70742/arlash.v2i2.431>.



Copyright © 2025 by Author(s)

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License

Abstrak: Ketidakharmonisan regulasi pariwisata halal di Indonesia, Pakistan, dan Nigeria menimbulkan perbedaan standar layanan, lemahnya kepastian hukum, dan inkonsistensi tata kelola yang berdampak pada daya saing destinasi halal. Penelitian ini bertujuan menganalisis dan membandingkan kerangka regulasi pariwisata halal di ketiga negara dengan menyoroti karakter sistem hukum, kekuatan kelembagaan, serta implikasinya terhadap konsistensi layanan dan perkembangan industri. Metode yang digunakan berupa studi pustaka yang mengkaji undang-undang, kebijakan pemerintah, dokumen kelembagaan, dan literatur akademik terkait tata kelola halal. Analisis isi dan analisis komparatif diterapkan untuk menelusuri pola persamaan, perbedaan, dan efektivitas kerangka regulasi. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa Indonesia memiliki standar regulasi halal yang lebih terintegrasi melalui BPJPH dan MUI, Pakistan cenderung mendorong mekanisme market-driven akibat ketiadaan regulasi formal pada sektor pariwisata halal, sedangkan Nigeria menampilkan struktur regulasi yang terfragmentasi karena sistem federal dan dual legal system sehingga standar layanan tidak seragam antar wilayah. Temuan ini menegaskan bahwa efektivitas regulasi berkorelasi erat dengan konfigurasi sistem hukum dan kapasitas tata kelola suatu negara. Penelitian ini memperkaya literatur dengan memberikan analisis hukum perbandingan yang komprehensif sebagai dasar konseptual bagi harmonisasi regulasi dalam memperkuat industri pariwisata halal secara global.

Kata kunci: ekonomi syariah; hukum perbandingan; pariwisata halal; regulasi; tata kelola.

Introduction

Halal tourism is emerging as a strategic sector in the global economy, driven by the increasing number of Muslim tourists, shifts in value-based tourism preferences, and growing awareness of Sharia-compliant services and facilities.¹ The Mastercard-Crescent Rating report indicates that both Muslim and non-Muslim countries are racing to adopt halal tourism standards to attract tourists and enhance the competitiveness of their destinations.² This phenomenon creates increasingly complex regulatory dynamics, as each country implements different legal approaches, policies, and certification instruments in accordance

¹ Hendri Hermawan Adinugraha, Ferida Rahmawati, and Rizky Andean, "Local Cultural Transformations in the Development of Halal Tourism in Indonesia and Malaysia," *Dampeng: Journal Art, Heritage and Culture* 1, no. 3 (2025): 162-179, <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.70742/dampeng.v1i3.354>.

² GMTI, "The 9th Edition of Mastercard-Crescentrating Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI) 2024," Report, 2024, <https://www.crescentrating.com/reports/global-muslim-travel-index-2024.html>.

with its respective social, political, and religious characteristics. Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria are interesting examples of the three major Muslim countries that have diverse legal backgrounds, institutional structures, and regulatory practices in developing the halal tourism sector.

Indonesia develops halal tourism through a relatively comprehensive formal legal framework, including the Halal Product Assurance Law and various derivative regulations that govern the certification, labelling, and governance of halal destinations. The Indonesian government extends the regulation to the tourism sector by emphasising the integration of halal services, increasing tourism business certification, and strengthening global competitiveness.³ Instead, Pakistan uses a looser approach and relies on relevant ministry policies and industry initiatives, without a single legal framework that explicitly regulates halal tourism.⁴ Nigeria has a more complex configuration due to its federal structure, the duality between Sharia law in several states and common law at the national level, as well as the diverse public perception of the concept of halal.⁵ This condition results in significant regulatory and implementation variations across the three countries, providing a broad scope for comparative analysis.

The *das sein* problem lies in the fragmented, inconsistent, and uneven halal tourism regulations across Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria, resulting in service disparities, weak governance, and limited consumer protection. The *das sollen* identifies the need for a harmonized, standardized, and well-coordinated regulatory framework that strengthens legal certainty, improves institutional capacity, and ensures consistent halal tourism practices to enhance competitiveness and protect Muslim travelers.

³ Bahtiar Effendi et al., "Preparation for the Implementation of Mandatory Halal Regulations for Food and Beverage Products in Indonesia," *Revista Jurídica* 3, no. 79 (2024): 55-86, <https://revista.unicuritiba.edu.br/index.php/RevJur/article/view/6806/pdf>.

⁴ Hendri Hermawan Adinugraha et al., "Digital Transformation Strategy for Implementing Halal Management: A Case Study of the MSME Industry in Pakistan," *Jurnal Al-Qalam* 31, no. 1 (2025): 146-61, <https://jurnalalqalam.or.id/index.php/Alqalam/article/view/1623/815>.

⁵ Hendrati Dwi Mulyaningsih et al., "Tracking and Tracing Technology in Upholding Halal Product Integrity: A Review," in *Technologies and Trends in the Halal Industry*, 2023, <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003368519-17>.

Research on the regulations governing this sector still faces some fundamental challenges, despite the continued growth of halal tourism. First, the global fragmentation of the concept of halal makes it difficult for governments to establish uniform legal standards. Indonesia regulates halal strictly through authoritative institutions such as the BPJPH, while Pakistan and Nigeria rely on sectoral approaches that are not always coordinated.⁶ Second, the gap between norms and practices persists due to differences in institutional capacity, a lack of regulatory harmonisation, and weak control over implementation in the field.⁷ Third, countries lack adequate legal instruments to systematically integrate Sharia principles into tourism policies, despite halal tourism being positioned as part of national economic strategies. These issues underscore the need for comparative law studies to identify regulatory models that are effective and tailored to each country's specific context.⁸

Previous studies have shown that most halal tourism research focuses more on marketing aspects, tourist perception, destination competitiveness, and industry development. The analysis of the legal framework of halal tourism has not developed proportionally, resulting in a gap between the development of industrial practices and the strengthening of regulatory aspects. The practice gap arises because halal tourism regulations in many countries are not yet comprehensive, do not encompass the entire tourism value chain, and often have a limited direct impact on business actors.⁹ In Pakistan, for example, the hospitality sector has offered halal services, but there are no formal regulations

⁶ Hendri Hermawan Adinugraha et al., "Halal Tourism in Indonesia: An Indonesian Council of Ulama National Sharia Board Fatwa Perspective," *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business* 8, no. 3 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2021.vol8.no3.0665>.

⁷ Nurjaya et al., "Halal Tourism in Indonesia: Regional Regulation and Indonesian Ulama Council Perspective," *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 2021, <https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2021.10.58>.

⁸ Nihayatul Maskuroh, "Development Model in Economic Growth: Dynamic Cycle on Halal Tourism," *Quality - Access to Success* 24, no. 193 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.47750/QAS/24.193.09>.

⁹ M. Hadyan Yunhas Purba et al., "The Preliminary Study on a Legal Framework Acceptance Relate to Halal Tourism in Lake Toba," *KnE Social Sciences*, 2024, <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v8i21.14756>.

ensuring uniformity of service standards.¹⁰ In Nigeria, the disharmony between the federal and state governments results in halal standards being local and uncoordinated.¹¹ The theoretical gap is also evident in the absence of an analytical model that describes the relationship between Sharia law, national law, and industrial practices in shaping halal tourism governance. Most theories of halal regulation still focus on food and beverage products, rather than the tourism sector, which is a more complex area of regulation.

A summary of several previous studies, which are relevant and serve as essential references in building this research argument, is presented to strengthen the academic foundation. Research in Indonesia indicates that the halal legal framework has provided a solid foundation for the tourism sector; however, its implementation still faces administrative challenges and a shortage of auditor resources.¹² Research in Pakistan emphasises that the halal tourism industry is growing due to market demand, but it is not supported by specific regulations that govern halal services as a whole.¹³ In Nigeria, various studies have noted that the implementation of halal practices is strongly influenced by local configurations, especially in areas where Sharia law is applicable.¹⁴ The three research groups highlight the need for a comparative framework that can explain regulatory variations, implementation gaps, and legal implications in the development of halal tourism.

¹⁰ Iffat Tahira, "Muslim Consumers' Perceptions of Marketing Korea as a Muslim-Friendly and Halal Tourism Destination: Future Implications," *Makara Human Behavior Studies in Asia* 26, no. 2 (2022), <https://doi.org/10.7454/hubs.asia.1090422>.

¹¹ Sulaiman Yahya and Shaizatulaqma Kamalul Ariffin, "Influencing Factors Of 7ps On Consumer Purchase Intention Of Halal Tourism In Kano-Nigeria," *BIMP-EAGA Journal for Sustainable Tourism Development* 10, no. 1 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.51200/bimpeagajtsd.v10i1.3621>.

¹² Novea Elysa Wardhani, "Existence of Fatwa of the National Sharia Council of the Indonesian Ulema Council (DSN-MUI) No. 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 Concerning Guidelines for Organizing Tourism Based on Sharia Principles: Between Spiritual and Regulatory," *Journal of Social Research* 2, no. 9 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.55324/josr.v2i9.1373>.

¹³ Muhammad Usman and Asmak Ab Rahman, "Funding Higher Education through Waqf: A Lesson from Pakistan," *International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management* 14, no. 2 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.1108/IMEFM-05-2019-0200>.

¹⁴ "The Impact Of Islamic Finance Towards Halal Product Development And Patronising Halal Smes In Nigeria," *International Journal of Islamic Business & Management*, 2022, <https://doi.org/10.46281/ijibm.v6i1.1902>.

To provide an initial comparative overview, the following table presents the fundamental differences in halal regulations in the three countries.

Table 1. Comparison of Halal Tourism Regulations in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria

Regulation Aspects	Indonesia	Pakistan	Nigeria
Legal Basis	Have a special law on halal and derivative regulations applied to the tourism sector.	It does not have a special law; Sectoral and administrative policies	Federal-state legal dualism; Halal regulations are local
Regulatory Authority	BPJPH, MUI, Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy	Ministry of Tourism, a non-state certification body	Sharia state governments, private institutions
Certification Approach	Formal, gradual, based on national standards	Voluntary, depending on the business actor	Varies, depending on local jurisdiction
Implementation in the Tourism Sector	Integrated, but not yet evenly distributed	Growing based on market demand	Not standardised, depending on Muslim-majority areas

Table 1 shows that each country has a different legal approach to regulating halal tourism. This difference not only reflects the variation in the legal system but also indicates how the government perceives halal tourism as an opportunity or a challenge within their respective social and political contexts. Indonesia tends to see halal tourism as part of a national strategy that requires comprehensive regulation. Pakistan views it as an industrial opportunity with no specific binding regulations. Nigeria addresses the issue of halal in the context of legal federalism, resulting in varying regulations across regions. These differences underscore the need for a comparative approach that can elucidate the strengths, weaknesses, and potential for future harmonisation.

This research can make an essential contribution to the literature on Sharia economic law. First, this study fills the theoretical gap by presenting a comparative analysis model that explains the relationship between Sharia law, national law, and tourism policy in three distinct Muslim countries. Second, this study answers the practical gap by mapping the effectiveness of regulations and implementation challenges faced by authorities in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria. Third, this research can make a valuable contribution to policymakers in developing a halal tourism regulatory model that is more responsive,

comprehensive, and aligned with the needs of the contemporary global market. Fourth, this research can strengthen a maqasid Sharia-based governance approach that emphasises the benefits, protection of Muslim consumers, and the sustainability of tourist destinations.

Based on the identification of phenomena, problems, research gaps, and previous research findings, the researcher stated that this research is essential and urgent to be carried out. This study aims to analyse and compare the regulatory frameworks of halal tourism in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria, based on the perspectives of Sharia economic law and comparative law. This research also aims to identify effective regulatory patterns, map implementation challenges, and propose recommendations for strengthening halal tourism regulations for the three countries. This research is expected to make both theoretical and practical contributions to the development of halal tourism law, thereby enhancing the concept of governance in line with Sharia values.

Method

This study employs a qualitative method with a literature review approach to analyse halal tourism regulations in depth in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria. This approach was chosen because the research focuses on a comparative understanding of legal documents, government policies, institutional reports, and academic literature related to halal tourism regulations. All data are collected from written sources, including laws, government regulations, decisions of halal certification bodies, reputable journal articles, international reports such as Mastercard-Crescent Ratings, and scientific publications from halal authorities in each country. The selection of sources is carried out purposively, based on relevance, academic validity, and contribution to answering the research questions.¹⁵

The researcher identified, selected, and grouped data based on the categories of regulation, governance, institutional capacity, and halal tourism implementation practices. The data analysis process was conducted using content analysis techniques and comparative analysis to identify patterns of similarities and differences in regulations across the three countries. The researcher extracted legal arguments and

¹⁵ Luis Mireles-Flores, "Recent Trends in Economic Methodology: A Literature Review," in *Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology*, vol. 36A, 2018, <https://doi.org/10.1108/S0743-41542018000036A008>.

interpreted the regulatory implications for the halal tourism industry using the perspective of Islamic Economic Law and comparative law approaches. Analytical frameworks, including legal system theory and maqasid al-Shariah principles, are used as analytical tools to strengthen data interpretation.

Research data validation techniques ensure that the data obtained is accurate, consistent, and reliable. Validation is carried out through source triangulation, comparison between legal documents, and content analysis to check the consistency of information. Researchers employ comparative analysis to assess the suitability of regulatory patterns across countries and ensure that data interpretation aligns with the legal and policy contexts of each country. A systematic literature approach also strengthens data credibility through cross-verification of various reliable sources. This qualitative method, based on literature studies, provides a strong rationale because the research data relies on legal documents and authoritative academic studies. All research procedures are carried out systematically to ensure that the process of identifying, selecting, and analysing data can comprehensively and scientifically address the main research problems.¹⁶

Result and Discussion

Configuration of Halal Tourism Regulations in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria

The configuration of halal tourism regulations in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria is rooted in the character of each country's legal system. Indonesia, as a unitary country, builds a halal legal framework centrally through the Halal Product Assurance Law and its derivative regulations. This regulation expands its oversight of the tourism sector through certification policies, standardisation of services, and supervision mechanisms by state institutions. This study found that the authority of halal certification lies with the Halal Product Assurance Agency (BPJPH). In contrast, the issuance of halal fatwas is the responsibility of the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI). A hierarchical legal structure yields a

¹⁶ Lindy Woodrow, "Writing the Literature Review," in *Doing a Master's Dissertation in TESOL and Applied Linguistics*, 2019, <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429504068-10>.

more centralised, formal, and binding regulatory framework for tourism business actors.¹⁷

Pakistan exhibits a distinct configuration, as the country lacks a specific law that explicitly regulates halal tourism. This study found that regulatory approaches are sectoral and administrative, depending on the ministry of tourism, tourism promotion agencies, and initiatives within the hospitality industry. The Pakistani government has not set a single standard for halal tourism services and facilities. The implementation of halal services is driven more by tourist demand than by formal legal instruments. The absence of a single authority leads to uncoordinated certification and standardisation practices.¹⁸

Nigeria shows a more diverse regulatory character due to the federal structure and the existence of a dual legal system that combines common law with Sharia law in certain states. Halal regulations, including in the tourism sector, are greatly influenced by local dynamics. States such as Kano, Sokoto, and Zamfara have formally implemented Sharia law, thereby strengthening halal regulations in the region.¹⁹ Meanwhile, states with a non-Muslim majority do not have significant halal regulations. This study found that there is no comprehensive national policy regulating halal tourism, resulting in local and fragmented standards for halal services.

Cross-border literature findings suggest that differences in legal systems result in non-uniform regulatory configurations. Countries with centralised legal systems, such as Indonesia, have more formal and coordinated halal regulations. Pakistan exhibits a liberal and market-driven approach, while Nigeria displays a decentralised regulatory model that is heavily influenced by the social and religious studies of the region. These differences in approaches

¹⁷ Azhar Alam et al., "A Comparative Systematic Literature Review between Indonesia and Malaysia Halal Tourism Studies (2010-2022)," *Multidisciplinary Reviews*, 2024, <https://doi.org/10.31893/multirev.2024061>.

¹⁸ Syed Asad Abbas Bokhari, "A Quantitative Study on the Factors Influencing Implementation of Cybersecurity Laws and Regulations in Pakistan," *Social Sciences* 12, no. 11 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci12110629>.

¹⁹ "Evaluation of Food Safety and Quality Regulations in Nigeria," *Journal of Law, Policy and Globalization*, 2019, <https://doi.org/10.7176/jlpg/92-15>.

affect the consistency of standardisation, the quality of halal services, and the supervisory capacity in each country.

Table 2. Differences in Halal Tourism Regulation Configurations in Three Countries

Aspects	Indonesia (Unitaris)	Pakistan (Sectoral)	Nigeria (Federal + Dual Legal System)
Legal basis	JPH, PP, derivative regulations	No special law	There is no specific national law
The Supervisory Authority	BPJPH, MUI	Ministries and industry institutions	State governments, local Sharia institutions
Certification approach	Formal, mandatory in stages	Voluntary	Local and varied
Standard consistency	Tall	Low	Not uniform
Character of the legal system	Centralist	Market-driven	Localised and fragmented

Table 2 shows that the configuration of halal tourism regulations not only depends on the needs of the industry but is also highly determined by the institutional structure and character of the legal system. Indonesia implements a stronger regulatory approach because the halal position has become a national legal agenda through the JPH Law. The centralistic approach results in more apparent legal certainty, measurable service standards, and structured oversight mechanisms. This study also noted that the implementation has not been evenly distributed because the capacity of halal auditors and the readiness of business actors still vary.

Pakistan presents a different situation. When formal regulation is not available, the industry moves to follow market dynamics. Muslim tourists have a significant influence on the provision of halal facilities in hotels and restaurants; however, without formal regulation, there is no guarantee of consistent halal services.²⁰ This shows that the absence of a legal framework results in industry flexibility but reduces certainty for Muslim tourists and investors who want a standard.

²⁰ Mudasra Sabreen, "Legislation on Halal Food in Pakistan: An Analytical Study," *Journal of Islamic and Religious Studies* 6, no. 1 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.36476/jirs.6:1.06.2021.14>.

Nigeria exemplifies how the federal legal structure results in fragmented regulations. While each state has different authorities, halal tourism lacks a comprehensive national framework. The existence of Sharia law in some states strengthens local halal services, but does not guarantee uniformity at the national level. This fragmentation makes it challenging for Nigeria to establish a robust national halal tourism brand, despite its sizable domestic market.²¹

The interpretation of the literature study reveals that the unitary legal system tends to give rise to centralised and formal halal policies. In contrast, the federal system yields varied local policies, and the dual legal system results in a layered legal configuration. All three models generate different opportunities and challenges. Indonesia has an advantage in legal certainty, Pakistan excels in market flexibility, and Nigeria is strong in a locally based, community-driven approach.

This study utilises Lawrence Friedman's Legal System Theory as a framework for elaboration. Friedman stated that the legal system consists of three main components, namely legal structure, legal substance, and legal culture.²² The findings of this literature review reflect how the three components work in the study of halal tourism in three countries. In the study of Indonesia, the legal structure is clearly evident through the involvement of institutions such as BPJPH, MUI, and the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy. *Legal substance* is realised through the JPH Law, PP, and derivative regulations that regulate halal certification. Legal culture supports the implementation of rules because the majority of Indonesians accept the importance of halal services in tourism. The alignment of these three components explains why Indonesia can build a more systematic halal regulatory framework.

Pakistan exhibits a weak legal structure in two key components: its legal framework and its legal substance. The absence of special laws means that legal instruments are not solid; however, the community's legal culture, which highly

²¹ Tijanni Muhammad and Besar Bin Ngah, "Islamic Financial Institutions And Their Impact On The Development Of Halal SMEs In Nigeria," *AZKA International Journal of Zakat & Social Finance*, 2020, <https://doi.org/10.51377/azjaf.vol1no01.6>.

²² Fahrizal S.Siagian, "Optimizing Lawrence Meir Friedman's Legal System Theory in the Authority to Investigate Corruption Crimes in Indonesia," *JUSTICES: Journal of Law* 2, no. 4 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.58355/justices.v2i4.93>.

values halal values, encourages industry players to provide halal services without formal legal obligations. Friedman's theory posits that when the structural and substantive aspects are weak, legal culture assumes a dominant role. Nigeria displays complexity because the legal structure is distributed between the federal and state governments. The legal substance varies because some regions apply Sharia law, while others do not. Legal culture in Muslim areas supports the strengthening of halal services, but in other places, it is less supported. Friedman's theory explains that the asynchronization of the three components results in fragmented regulation. This elaboration demonstrates that Friedman's theory can comprehensively describe the relationship between the legal system and the configuration of halal tourism regulations.²³

National legal and policy structures significantly influence halal regulations and impact the competitiveness of tourist destinations.²⁴ Countries with stronger Sharia regulations have more consistent halal facilities.²⁵ The findings on Pakistan align with a study, which explains that the halal industry in Pakistan has developed organically without a formal legal framework.²⁶ Other research supports the findings in the Nigerian case, indicating that the dual legal system leads to variations in halal implementation across states.²⁷ The previous research corroborates the results of this study, which indicate that the configuration of halal tourism regulations is not universal but is significantly influenced by the legal system, institutional capacity, and community culture.

²³ Ridwan Arifin et al., "A Discourse of Justice and Legal Certainty in Stolen Assets Recovery in Indonesia: Analysis of Radbruch's Formula and Friedman's Theory," *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi* 6, no. 2 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v6i2.9596>.

²⁴ Muhammad Yasir Yusuf et al., "Halal Tourism to Promote Community's Economic Growth: A Model for Aceh, Indonesia," *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 29, no. 4 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.47836/pjssh.29.4.42>.

²⁵ Muhammad Majdy Amiruddin, "Critical Review on Sharia Regulation of Halal Tourism and Its Contribution to Creative Economies," *Mazahibuna*, 2022, <https://doi.org/10.24252/mh.vi.33522>.

²⁶ Muhammad Sohaib and Faraz Jamil, "An Insight of Meat Industry in Pakistan with Special Reference to Halal Meat: A Comprehensive Review," *Korean Journal for Food Science of Animal Resources* 37, no. 3 (2017), <https://doi.org/10.5851/kosfa.2017.37.3.329>.

²⁷ Idris Oyewale Oyelakin and Asnidar Hanim Yusuf, "Prospects of Halal Products in Developing Countries: Comparison between Nigeria and Malaysia," *International Journal of Business Society* 2, no. 8 (2018), <https://doi.org/10.30566/ijo-bs/2018.285>.

Comparative Analysis of Halal Tourism Governance Models in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria

The halal tourism governance models in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria exhibit distinct characteristics based on the configuration of their legal systems, institutional capacities, and policy orientations. Indonesia implements a more structured governance because the government has established halal regulations through the Halal Product Assurance Law, Government Regulations, and tourism sector policies. BPJPH emerged as the leading authority in halal certification, while the MUI played a role in issuing halal fatwas. Coordination between institutions is evident through the synergy of BPJPH, MUI, the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy, and local governments, as demonstrated by the standardisation and certification program for halal destinations. Indonesia has clearer halal service standards, including requirements for hotels, restaurants, spas, and other tourism facilities. The effectiveness of supervision is not even because the capacity of halal auditors and the level of readiness of business actors are still diverse.²⁸

Pakistan shows a different model of governance. There is no national regulation that formally governs halal tourism, so the sector's governance is more dependent on the initiatives of the Ministry of Tourism, industry associations, and service providers. The findings of the literature review show that there is no structured coordination between institutions. The hotel, restaurant, and travel agency industries offer halal services in response to market demand, rather than as a result of legal requirements. Halal service standards are not standardised nationally, so the quality of service depends on the policies of each business actor. Supervision is not adequate because there is no institution officially assigned to monitor the consistency of halal services. The governance model in Pakistan shows a market-driven approach.²⁹

²⁸ Yogi Darma Saputra, Leriza Desitama Anggraini, and Muhammad Hamdan Sayadi, "The Effect of Socialization of SAK EMKM, Accounting Understanding, and Level of Readiness of MSME Business Actors towards the Application of SAK EMKM in the Preparation of MSME Financial Reports (Case Study of MSMEs in Palembang City)," *International Journal of Community Service & Engagement* 3, no. 2 (2022), <https://doi.org/10.47747/ijcse.v3i2.718>.

²⁹ Mahroo Khan et al., "The Role of Consumer Willingness to Pay for Halal Certification in Pakistan," *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 10, no. 4 (2019), <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-09-2018-0155>.

Nigeria exhibits a decentralised governance model. The federal system that combines common law and Sharia law results in halal tourism regulations differing between regions. States that apply Sharia law, such as Kano, Zamfara, and Sokoto, have relatively stronger halal regulations. Local Sharia institutions play a role in providing halal certification, although they are not synchronised nationally. Other states with a non-Muslim majority do not have formal halal tourism standards. Interagency coordination is minimal, both between the federal and state governments and across sectors of the tourism industry. Halal service supervision is highly varied and lacks national standardisation.³⁰

The three countries show different implementation gaps. Indonesia faces a gap between strong regulations and uneven implementation capacity. Pakistan faces a gap between market demand and the absence of regulation. Nigeria faces disparities between regions due to differences in legal systems, cultures, and institutional capacity. This study found that differences in institutional capacity are a key factor in shaping the effectiveness of halal tourism governance.

Table 3. Comparison of Halal Tourism Governance Model

Aspects	Indonesia	Pakistan	Nigeria
Regulatory framework	Formal, standardised	Informal, dependent	market-Varies between regions
Inter-agency coordination	Tall	Low	Limited
Halal service standards	Clear and measurable	Non-standardized	Differs between states
Effectiveness of supervision	Moderate	Low	Uneven
Dominant factors	Country regulations	Market demand	Local dynamics

Table 3 explains that the legal structure and orientation of each country greatly influence halal tourism governance. Indonesia adopts a formal law-based governance paradigm with a focus on standardisation, policy integration, and service quality improvement. The way BPJPH and MUI operate demonstrates that halal tourism governance in Indonesia is embedded within a governance framework based on regulations and legal certainty. The interpretation of the

³⁰ Trimulato et al., “The Role of Sharia Tourism Business Towards Economic Growth in Indonesia and Nigeria,” *Milkiyah: Jurnal Hukum Ekonomi Syariah* 2, no. 1 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.46870/milkiyah.v2i1.266>.

literature review's findings reveals that Indonesia is striving to establish a globally competitive halal tourism industry through the implementation of binding legal instruments and official oversight mechanisms. However, this model faces challenges, including limited human resource capacity, bureaucratic complexity, and regional disparities.³¹

Pakistan demonstrates a governance model based on market mechanisms. When there are no formal regulations, industry players respond to the needs of tourists by creating halal services.³² The study's interpretation reveals that market forces are the primary drivers of halal tourism. Market flexibility provides opportunities for innovation, but the absence of a standard creates a risk of service inconsistency, uncertainty for tourists, and weak Muslim consumer protections. Additionally, the government's institutional capacity to develop halal tourism remains low due to the absence of specific policies regulating coordination and supervision.

Nigeria shows that halal tourism governance is tied to local studies. The federal system creates a diversity of regulations, while the dual legal system results in different treatment of halal services. The interpretation of the study reveals that a bottom-up approach characterises governance in Nigeria and is strongly influenced by the community. Regulations in areas that implement Sharia law are stronger; however, because there is no national coordination mechanism, standardisation of services does not occur. This situation makes it difficult to establish a national image for halal tourism, thereby reducing the industry's effectiveness.³³

A comparison of Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria reveals that halal tourism governance is shaped by three primary factors: institutional capacity,

³¹ Singgih Muheramtohad and Zuhdan Ady Fataron, "The Islamic Lifestyle of the Muslim Middle Economy Class and the Opportunities for the Halal Tourism Industry in Indonesia," *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry* 4, no. 1 (2022), <https://doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2022.4.1.10828>.

³² Muhammad Abdullah, Muzammil Khurshid, and Muhammad Haris Khan, "Developing Trust through Social Media Influencers and Halal Tourism to Impact the Travel Decision of Travelers," *Journal of Islamic and Religious Studies* 7, no. 1 (2022), <https://doi.org/10.36476/jirs.7:1.06.2022.17>.

³³ Nurlaila Madinatul Qoir, "Impact of Tourism Sector on Economic Growth in OIC Countries," *Halal Tourism and Pilgrimage* 3, no. 2 (2024), <https://doi.org/10.58968/htp.v3i2.429>.

state policy direction, and regulatory model. Indonesia relies on formal regulations and a clear bureaucratic structure. Pakistan relies on market mechanisms and industrial initiatives. Nigeria depends on the role of communities and local legal structures. The three models have different strengths and weaknesses, so they cannot be compared absolutely, but can be analysed to understand how halal tourism governance is formed in various legal and social studies.

This study employs the Good Governance Theory as a framework for elaboration. This theory emphasises the importance of accountability, transparency, effectiveness, coordination, participation, and legal certainty as core elements of good governance.³⁴ This theory is relevant for analysing halal tourism governance because the sector requires good coordination between governments, certification bodies, industry, and the community.

In Indonesian studies, the principle of governance can be seen in legal certainty and inter-institutional coordination. The government has established clear halal regulations, certification authorities, and service standards; however, the principle of effectiveness remains suboptimal due to an uneven distribution of implementation capacity in the field. The principle of industry participation has been implemented through the involvement of business actors in certification, although challenges remain related to cost and procedure.³⁵

Pakistan has shown weak governance principles in terms of legal certainty, coordination, and accountability. Without formal regulation, governance relies on industry initiatives. The principle of participation is powerful, but the effectiveness and coordination are very weak because no institution coordinates halal service providers. Good Governance theory suggests that without a policy framework, governance cannot operate effectively, despite high market demand.³⁶

³⁴ Woleola J Ekundayo, "Good Governance Theory and the Quest for Good Governance in Nigeria," *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 7, no. 5 (2017).

³⁵ Prisca Listiningrum et al., "Juridical Analysis of Policy Concerning Oil Palm Estate Management in Indonesia," *Legality: Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum* 29, no. 1 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.22219/ljih.v29i1.14376>.

³⁶ Naila Bano, Siliu Yang, and Easar Alam, "Emerging Challenges in Technical Vocational Education and Training of Pakistan in the Context of CPEC," *Economies* 10, no. 7 (2022), <https://doi.org/10.3390/economies10070153>.

Nigeria shows weak national coordination and legal certainty due to the high variation between states. The principles of accountability and equality are not fulfilled because there are differences in treatment between Muslim and non-Muslim areas. Although the participation of the Muslim community is strong in the Sharia state, the absence of national coordination leads to incomplete governance. The Good Governance Theory explains that legal and institutional fragmentation hinders the effectiveness of halal sector governance.³⁷

The findings of this research literature align with the study, which emphasises that halal tourism governance requires consistent regulations and coordination between institutions.³⁸ The effectiveness of halal destinations depends on service standards, legal certainty, and supervisory capacity.³⁹ The findings regarding Pakistan are strengthened by research, which shows that halal tourism is developing in a market-oriented manner due to the absence of special regulations.⁴⁰ The results of the study on Nigeria are strengthened by the analysis of the research, which concluded that the dual legal system leads to variations in the implementation of halal across regions. The findings of this research support the conclusion that the institutional capacity and legal structure of the country determine halal tourism governance.⁴¹

The differences in halal tourism governance models in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria are due to different political, economic, and regulatory configurations. Indonesia has a centralized political structure and an economic

³⁷ Ejikeme Jombo Nwagwu et al., "Vote Buying During 2015 And 2019 General Elections: Manifestation and Implications on Democratic Development in Nigeria," *Cogent Social Sciences*, 2022, <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2021.1995237>.

³⁸ Moh Bahrudin, "Halal Tourism Governance Based on the Fatwa of the National Sharia Council on Tourism Improvement," *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism* 13, no. 7 (2022), [https://doi.org/10.14505/jemt.v13.7\(63\).25](https://doi.org/10.14505/jemt.v13.7(63).25).

³⁹ Dina Hariani and Mohd Hafiz Hanafiah, "The Competitiveness, Challenges and Opportunities to Accommodate the Halal Tourism Market: A Sharia-Law Tourism Destination Perspectives," *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 15, no. 3 (2024), <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-05-2023-0147>.

⁴⁰ Mohammad Alam and Danish Ali, "Exploration of Islamic Tourism Initiatives in Pakistan; Insights from Muslim Nations with a Robust Halal Economy," *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences Research* 5, no. 1 (2022), <https://doi.org/10.37605/pjhssr.v5i1.307>.

⁴¹ Femi Owolade, "Writing a Colonial Legal History of Northern Nigeria: An Analysis of Methods and Sources," *History in Africa* 50 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.1017/hia.2023.11>.

orientation that places halal tourism on the national agenda, resulting in formal and standardized regulations. Pakistan, with its weak institutional capacity and an economy heavily influenced by market dynamics, tends to rely on market-driven mechanisms without integrated regulations. Nigeria, as a federal country with a dual legal system, has fragmented regulations because each state has its own distinct local authorities and interests.

Legal Implications for Destination Development and Halal Tourism Industry

Halal tourism regulations in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria have led to distinct legal implications for the dynamics of destination development and the halal tourism industry. These variations are primarily influenced by differences in the legal system, institutional quality, the level of regulatory harmonisation, and local economic capacity. In Indonesia, the Halal Product Assurance Law, the Ministerial Regulation of the Ministry of Tourism, and the establishment of the Halal Product Assurance Agency provide relatively strong legal certainty for industry players. A unitary national legal system enables more centralised regulatory coordination. The legal impact is evident in the increase in restaurant and hotel certifications, despite business actors still facing cost constraints, halal literacy, and capacity disparities across regions.

The findings of a literature review in Pakistan indicate that the dual legal system, comprising federal law and Sharia regulation at the provincial level, has more complex legal implications. Halal standards are issued by the Pakistan Halal Authority (PHA), but their implementation depends on the capacity of each province. The legal impact affects uneven legal certainty and variations in the quality of certification. In provinces with a strong religious orientation, such as Punjab, the implementation of regulations is more progressive, resulting in a more developed halal tourism industry. Areas with political conflict and low administrative capacity are unable to capitalise on the potential of the halal market.⁴²

Nigeria exhibits a distinct pattern of legal implications due to the coexistence of a dual religious legal system, comprising national law and Sharia

⁴² PHA, "Pakistan Halal Authority (PHA)," News, 2025, <https://www.pakistanhalalauthority.gov.pk/>.

law, which applies in the northern states. Nigeria does not yet have a national law on halal tourism; however, some Islamic institutions, such as NAHCON and local certification bodies, act as non-state stakeholders. As a result, the legal implications are fragmentary and do not produce uniform certainty. Industry players face procedural uncertainty, so the development of halal destinations is highly dependent on the initiatives of Muslim communities and local governments.⁴³

A comparison of the three countries shows that a strong and uniform legal framework has direct implications for industry readiness, Muslim consumer protection, and investment attractiveness. Indonesia is in a more mature stage of institutionalisation. Pakistan faces the challenge of federal harmonisation. Nigeria still needs a comprehensive national legal framework.

Table 4. Key Legal Implications for Halal Tourism in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria

Country	Legal Certainty	Readiness of Muslim Business Actors	Consumer Protection	Investment Attraction	Key Challenges
Indonesia	Tall; there are clear laws and institutions	Pretty good, but varies between regions	Guaranteed with official halal certification	Tall; investors trust more	Certification fees, halal literacy
Pakistan	Moderate; Influenced by Federal-Provincial Regulatory Conflicts	Uneven between provinces	Varies according to provincial capacity	Moderate; to great potential yet unstable	Policy disharmonisation, political conflicts
Nigeria	Low; There is no national law yet	Relying on local initiatives	Not uniform; depending on local institutions	Low; Investors are sceptical of certainty	Regulatory fragmentation, weak coordination

Table 4 presents the results of a literature analysis, which shows that regulations not only provide a basis for legality but also form an incentive structure that affects the behaviour of tourism business actors, the credibility of halal services,

⁴³ Raji Saheed et al., “Health Issues of Nigerian Muslim Pilgrims in The Immediate Post-Covid-19 Era Hajj Year 2022- Part II (Non-Communicable Diseases),” *International Islamic Medical Journal* 5, no. 1 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.33086/iimj.v5i1.4210>.

and the attractiveness of destinations. In Indonesia, legal certainty about halal standards encourages the behaviour of business actors to adapt services to the needs of Muslim tourists. The regulation strengthens the consumer protection mechanism through certification and supervision of BPJPH and LPH. This regulatory effect creates an ecosystem that is relatively conducive to investment, especially in the culinary, hotel, spa, and halal travel sectors, but challenges arise from implementation disparities in areas that lack administrative capacity.

In Pakistan, the interpretation of regulations is more influenced by the dynamics of federal politics and the country's religious diversity. Reliance on provincial authorities results in unequal service standards, thereby limiting the consistency of the Muslim tourist experience. The misalignment between national and provincial regulations is slowing down the penetration of the global halal market, despite the enormous potential of the industry. This reduces Pakistan's competitiveness compared to countries with more stable regulatory systems.⁴⁴

Nigeria presents a more challenging situation, as the absence of a central legal framework means the industry operates without uniform formal standards. Legal uncertainty hinders the acceleration of investment, including investors from OIC member states. The absence of regulation also reduces the level of trust of Muslim tourists, especially from the Middle East and Southeast Asia. Horizontal coordination between Islamic institutions, local governments, and industry players remains weak, resulting in sporadic development and a lack of consolidation in the halal industry.⁴⁵

The interpretation of the three studies reveals a direct relationship between the legal structure and the industry's performance. The clearer the legal framework and the more integrated the supervisory agency, the higher the industry's readiness to respond to the needs of the global halal market. In contrast, disharmonious regulations lead to high compliance costs and erode consumer trust.

⁴⁴ Fazila Bhimji, "Cosmopolitan Belonging and Diaspora: Second-Generation British Muslim Women Travelling to South Asia," *Citizenship Studies* 12, no. 4 (2008), <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621020802184259>.

⁴⁵ Kevin Croke and Osondu Ogbuaji, "Health Reform in Nigeria: The Politics of Primary Health Care and Universal Health Coverage," *Health Policy and Planning* 39, no. 1 (2024), <https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/czad107>.

Maqasid al-Shariah, especially the concepts of *hifz al-din*, *hifz al-nafs*, and *hifz al-mal*, provide a theoretical framework for understanding the legal implications for the halal tourism industry. Reasonable regulations should protect the interests of the people, ensure the safety of consumption, promote transparency in transactions, and foster justice between business actors and consumers. From the perspective of maqasid, halal tourism is not just a commercial product, but part of efforts to maintain religious values and ensure the sustainability of Sharia-based economic activities.⁴⁶

Indonesia is relatively able to realise the principles of maqasid through a more consistent halal certification system, consumer protection, and education of business actors. Halal regulations provide room for the improvement of *hifz al-din* through halal service assurance and *hifz al-mal* through transaction clarity and investment security. Pakistan implements maqasid with variations between provinces. In areas with strong administration, maqasid are more realised, but in other places, the potential benefits are lost due to weak regulations. Nigeria only partially fulfils the maqasid because the absence of national laws makes it challenging to implement consumer protection and investment certainty. The findings of the literature review indicate that the success of implementing maqasid depends on the quality of regulations and institutional capacity. Ineffective or non-uniform regulations lead to partial and sporadic achievement of maqasid.

The findings of the literature review in this study align with previous studies that emphasise the importance of a stable legal framework for the halal industry. Halal tourism is growing rapidly in countries with clear regulations and a strong certification system.⁴⁷ Legal certainty has a direct effect on the beliefs of Muslim tourists.⁴⁸ Research in Pakistan reveals that the disharmony

⁴⁶ Winda Fitri, "The Legal Protection for Security Crowdfunding Based on Sharia Investment in MSMEs Economic Recovery," *International Journal of Law Reconstruction* 7, no. 1 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.26532/ijlr.v7i1.30917>.

⁴⁷ Norliza Katuk et al., "Halal Certification for Tourism Marketing: The Attributes and Attitudes of Food Operators in Indonesia," *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 12, no. 5 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-03-2020-0068>.

⁴⁸ Muthia Sakti and Dwi Aryanti Ramadhani, "Halal Certification of Micro and Small Enterprises' Food Products for Consumer Protection," *Amsir Law Journal* 5, no. 1 (2023), <https://doi.org/10.36746/alj.v5i1.296>.

between federal and provincial policies hinders the performance of the halal industry.⁴⁹ In Nigeria, other study confirms that the absence of a national legal framework hinders the consistency of halal services and reduces the interest of foreign investors.⁵⁰ These studies support the conclusion that institutional capacity and regulatory uniformity are critical factors in measuring the legal implications of halal tourism.

Conclusion

This study concludes that halal tourism regulations in Indonesia, Pakistan, and Nigeria have distinct characteristics, as they are directly influenced by the configuration of each country's legal system, institutional capacity, and policy orientation. The analysis reveals that Indonesia establishes halal tourism within a standardised legal framework through the Halal Product Assurance Law, authoritative institutions such as BPJPH and MUI, as well as sectoral policies that integrate certification into the tourism industry. This model yields more substantial legal certainty, consistency in services, and a relatively stable institutional foundation, thereby enhancing the competitiveness of halal destinations. Pakistan presents a model driven by market dynamics due to the absence of specific regulations and weak federal–provincial coordination. This pattern creates industry flexibility, but reduces legal certainty and consistency of halal services. Nigeria exhibits high regulatory fragmentation due to its federal structure and dual legal system, resulting in variations in halal standards across different regions. As a result, consumer protection, investment certainty, and the provision of halal services are not uniform across all areas.

Differences in regulatory implementation affect the quality of halal tourism governance and determine the effectiveness of industrial development in the three countries. The comparative legal study in this research provides a theoretical contribution by enhancing the understanding of the relationship between the legal system and halal governance, as well as a practical contribution in the form of identifying the direction of regulatory harmonisation needed to strengthen the global

⁴⁹ Abdul Waheed, Thomas Bernward Fischer, and Muhammad Irfan Khan, "Climate Change Policy Coherence across Policies, Plans, and Strategies in Pakistan—Implications for the China–Pakistan Economic Corridor Plan," *Environmental Management* 67, no. 5 (2021), <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00267-021-01449-y>.

⁵⁰ Waheed, Bernward Fischer, and Khan.

halal industry. The limitation of the research lies in the lack of an in-depth analysis of the domestic economic and political factors of each country. Further research should extend the analysis to other Muslim and non-Muslim countries and integrate empirical approaches to enrich the comparative findings.

References

- Abdullah, Muhammad, Muzammil Khurshid, and Muhammad Haris Khan. "Developing Trust through Social Media Influencers and Halal Tourism to Impact the Travel Decision of Travelers." *Journal of Islamic and Religious Studies* 7, no. 1 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.36476/jirs.7:1.06.2022.17>.
- Adinugraha, Hendri Hermawan, Ismail Fahmi Arrauf Nasution, Faisal Faisal, Maraimbang Daulay, Ikhwanuddin Harahap, T. Wildan, Muhamad Takhim, Agus Riyadi, and Agus Purwanto. "Halal Tourism in Indonesia: An Indonesian Council of Ulama National Sharia Board Fatwa Perspective." *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business* 8, no. 3 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.13106/jafeb.2021.vol8.no3.0665>.
- Adinugraha, Hendri Hermawan, Ferida Rahmawati, and Rizky Andean. "Local Cultural Transformations in the Development of Halal Tourism in Indonesia and Malaysia." *Dampeng: Journal Art, Heritage and Culture* 1, no. 3 (2025): 162-179. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.70742/dampeng.v1i3.354>.
- Adinugraha, Hendri Hermawan, Ferida Rahmawati, Muhamad Shulthoni, and Zohaib Hassan Sain. "Digital Transformation Strategy for Implementing Halal Management: A Case Study of the MSME Industry in Pakistan." *Jurnal Al-Qalam* 31, no. 1 (2025): 146-61. <https://jurnalalqalam.or.id/index.php/Alqalam/article/view/1623/815>.
- Alam, Azhar, Ririn Tri Ratnasari, Muhamad Nafik Hadi Ryandono, Ari Prasetyo, Yasmin Syahidah, and Faiz Adib Bafana. "A Comparative Systematic Literature Review between Indonesia and Malaysia Halal Tourism Studies (2010-2022)." *Multidisciplinary Reviews*, 2024. <https://doi.org/10.31893/multirev.2024061>.
- Alam, Mohammad, and Danish Ali. "Exploration of Islamic Tourism Initiatives in Pakistan; Insights from Muslim Nations with a Robust Halal Economy." *Pakistan Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences Research* 5, no. 1 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.37605/pjhssr.v5i1.307>.
- Amiruddin, Muhammad Majdy. "Critical Review on Sharia Regulation of Halal Tourism and Its Contribution to Creative Economies." *Mazahibuna*, 2022. <https://doi.org/10.24252/mh.vi.33522>.
- Arifin, Ridwan, Cahya Wulandari, Muliadi, Indah Sri Utari, and Tri Imam

- Munandar. "A Discourse of Justice and Legal Certainty in Stolen Assets Recovery in Indonesia: Analysis of Radbruch's Formula and Friedman's Theory." *Volksgeist: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum Dan Konstitusi* 6, no. 2 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.24090/volksgeist.v6i2.9596>.
- Bahrudin, Moh. "Halal Tourism Governance Based on the Fatwa of the National Sharia Council on Tourism Improvement." *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism* 13, no. 7 (2022). [https://doi.org/10.14505/jemt.v13.7\(63\).25](https://doi.org/10.14505/jemt.v13.7(63).25).
- Bano, Naila, Siliu Yang, and Easar Alam. "Emerging Challenges in Technical Vocational Education and Training of Pakistan in the Context of CPEC." *Economies* 10, no. 7 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.3390/economies10070153>.
- Bhimji, Fazila. "Cosmopolitan Belonging and Diaspora: Second-Generation British Muslim Women Travelling to South Asia." *Citizenship Studies* 12, no. 4 (2008). <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621020802184259>.
- Bokhari, Syed Asad Abbas. "A Quantitative Study on the Factors Influencing Implementation of Cybersecurity Laws and Regulations in Pakistan." *Social Sciences* 12, no. 11 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci12110629>.
- Croke, Kevin, and Osondu Ogbuoji. "Health Reform in Nigeria: The Politics of Primary Health Care and Universal Health Coverage." *Health Policy and Planning* 39, no. 1 (2024). <https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/czad107>.
- Effendi, Bahtiar, Muhammad Khoirul Fikri, Hendri Hermawan Adinugraha, Susminingsih, and Ahmad Furqon. "Preparation for the Implementation of Mandatory Halal Regulations for Food and Beverage Products in Indonesia." *Revista Juridica* 3, no. 79 (2024): 55-86. <https://revista.unicuritiba.edu.br/index.php/RevJur/article/view/6806/pdf>.
- Ekundayo, Woleola J. "Good Governance Theory and the Quest for Good Governance in Nigeria." *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 7, no. 5 (2017).
- "Evaluation of Food Safety and Quality Regulations in Nigeria." *Journal of Law, Policy and Globalization*, 2019. <https://doi.org/10.7176/jlpg/92-15>.
- Fahrizal S.Siagian. "Optimizing Lawrence Meir Friedman's Legal System Theory in the Authority to Investigate Corruption Crimes in Indonesia." *JUSTICES: Journal of Law* 2, no. 4 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.58355/justices.v2i4.93>.
- Fitri, Winda. "The Legal Protection for Security Crowdfunding Based on Sharia Investment in MSMEs Economic Recovery." *International Journal of Law*

- Reconstruction* 7, no. 1 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.26532/ijlr.v7i1.30917>.
- GMTI. "The 9th Edition of Mastercard-Crescentrating Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI) 2024." Report, 2024. <https://www.crescentrating.com/reports/global-muslim-travel-index-2024.html>.
- Hadyan Yunhas Purba, M., Ningrum Natasya Sirait, Cheryl Patriana Yuswar, Angayar Kanni Ramaiah, Azila Azmi, and Azrul Abdullah. "The Preliminary Study on a Legal Framework Acceptance Relate to Halal Tourism in Lake Toba." *KnE Social Sciences*, 2024. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v8i21.14756>.
- Hariani, Dina, and Mohd Hafiz Hanafiah. "The Competitiveness, Challenges and Opportunities to Accommodate the Halal Tourism Market: A Sharia-Law Tourism Destination Perspectives." *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 15, no. 3 (2024). <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-05-2023-0147>.
- Katuk, Norliza, Ku Ruhana Ku-Mahamud, Kalsom Kayat, Mohd Noor Abdul Hamid, Nur Haryani Zakaria, and Ayi Purbasari. "Halal Certification for Tourism Marketing: The Attributes and Attitudes of Food Operators in Indonesia." *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 12, no. 5 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-03-2020-0068>.
- Khan, Mahroo, Arsalan Najmi, Waqar Ahmed, and Ameenullah Aman. "The Role of Consumer Willingness to Pay for Halal Certification in Pakistan." *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 10, no. 4 (2019). <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-09-2018-0155>.
- Listiningrum, Prisca, Rizqi Bachtiar, Dararida Fandra Mahira, and Rumi Suwardiyati. "Juridical Analysis of Policy Concerning Oil Palm Estate Management in Indonesia." *Legality: Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum* 29, no. 1 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.22219/ljih.v29i1.14376>.
- Maskuroh, Nihayatul. "Development Model in Economic Growth: Dynamic Cycle on Halal Tourism." *Quality - Access to Success* 24, no. 193 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.47750/QAS/24.193.09>.
- Mireles-Flores, Luis. "Recent Trends in Economic Methodology: A Literature Review." In *Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology*, Vol. 36A, 2018. <https://doi.org/10.1108/S0743-41542018000036A008>.
- Muhammad, Tijanni, and Besar Bin Ngah. "Islamic Financial Institutions And Their Impact On The Development Of Halal SMEs In Nigeria." *AZKA International Journal of Zakat & Social Finance*, 2020. <https://doi.org/10.51377/azjaf.vol1no01.6>.
- Muheramtohadhi, Singgih, and Zuhdan Ady Fataron. "The Islamic Lifestyle of the Muslim Middle Economy Class and the Opportunities for the Halal

- Tourism Industry in Indonesia.” *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry* 4, no. 1 (2022).
<https://doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2022.4.1.10828>.
- Mulyaningsih, Hendrati Dwi, Winai Dahlan, Acharee Suksuwan, Kasinee Katelakha, Santi Rahmawati, and Ani Wahyu Rachmawati. “Tracking and Tracing Technology in Upholding Halal Product Integrity: A Review.” In *Technologies and Trends in the Halal Industry*, 2023.
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003368519-17>.
- Nurjaya, Vip Paramarta, R. Roro Vemmi Kesuma Dewi, Kusworo, Surasni, Fika Rahmanita, Syafaatul Hidayati, and Denok Sunarsi. “Halal Tourism in Indonesia: Regional Regulation and Indonesian Ulama Council Perspective.” *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 2021.
<https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2021.10.58>.
- Nwagwu, Ejikeme Jombo, Onyinyeomachukwu Gift Uwaechia, Kingsley Chigozie Udegbumam, and Rebecca Nnamani. “Vote Buying During 2015 And 2019 General Elections: Manifestation and Implications on Democratic Development in Nigeria.” *Cogent Social Sciences*, 2022.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2021.1995237>.
- Owolade, Femi. “Writing a Colonial Legal History of Northern Nigeria: An Analysis of Methods and Sources.” *History in Africa* 50 (2023).
<https://doi.org/10.1017/hia.2023.11>.
- Oyelakin, Idris Oyewale, and Asnidar Hanim Yusuf. “Prospects of Halal Products in Developing Countries: Comparison between Nigeria and Malaysia.” *International Journal of Business Society* 2, no. 8 (2018).
<https://doi.org/10.30566/ijo-bs/2018.285>.
- PHA. “Pakistan Halal Authority (PHA).” News, 2025.
<https://www.pakistanhalalauthority.gov.pk/>.
- Qoir, Nurlaila Madinatul. “Impact of Tourism Sector on Economic Growth in OIC Countries.” *Halal Tourism and Pilgrimage* 3, no. 2 (2024).
<https://doi.org/10.58968/htp.v3i2.429>.
- Sabreen, Mudrasa. “Legislation on Halal Food in Pakistan: An Analytical Study.” *Journal of Islamic and Religious Studies* 6, no. 1 (2021).
<https://doi.org/10.36476/jirs.6:1.06.2021.14>.
- Saheed, Raji, Ismaila Isiaka, Amina Saleh Mande, and Adam Ahmad. “Health Issues of Nigerian Muslim Pilgrims in The Immediate Post-Covid-19 Era Hajj Year 2022- Part II (Non-Communicable Diseases).” *International Islamic Medical Journal* 5, no. 1 (2023).
<https://doi.org/10.33086/iimj.v5i1.4210>.
- Sakti, Muthia, and Dwi Aryanti Ramadhani. “Halal Certification of Micro and

- Small Enterprises' Food Products for Consumer Protection." *Amsir Law Journal* 5, no. 1 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.36746/alj.v5i1.296>.
- Saputra, Yogi Darma, Leriza Desitama Anggraini, and Muhammad Hamdan Sayadi. "The Effect of Socialization of SAK EMKM, Accounting Understanding, and Level of Readiness of MSME Business Actors towards the Application of SAK EMKM in the Preparation of MSME Financial Reports (Case Study of MSMEs in Palembang City)." *International Journal of Community Service & Engagement* 3, no. 2 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.47747/ijcse.v3i2.718>.
- Sohaib, Muhammad, and Faraz Jamil. "An Insight of Meat Industry in Pakistan with Special Reference to Halal Meat: A Comprehensive Review." *Korean Journal for Food Science of Animal Resources* 37, no. 3 (2017). <https://doi.org/10.5851/kosfa.2017.37.3.329>.
- Tahira, Iffat. "Muslim Consumers' Perceptions of Marketing Korea as a Muslim-Friendly and Halal Tourism Destination: Future Implications." *Makara Human Behavior Studies in Asia* 26, no. 2 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.7454/hubs.asia.1090422>.
- "The Impact Of Islamic Finance Towards Halal Product Development And Patronising Halal Smes In Nigeria." *International Journal of Islamic Business & Management*, 2022. <https://doi.org/10.46281/ijibm.v6i1.1902>.
- Trimulato, Sagir Muhammad Sulaiman, Muhlis, and St Hafsa Umar. "The Role of Sharia Tourism Business Towards Economic Growth in Indonesia and Nigeria." *Milkiyah: Jurnal Hukum Ekonomi Syariah* 2, no. 1 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.46870/milkiyah.v2i1.266>.
- Usman, Muhammad, and Asmak Ab Rahman. "Funding Higher Education through Waqf: A Lesson from Pakistan." *International Journal of Islamic and Middle Eastern Finance and Management* 14, no. 2 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.1108/IMEFM-05-2019-0200>.
- Waheed, Abdul, Thomas Bernward Fischer, and Muhammad Irfan Khan. "Climate Change Policy Coherence across Policies, Plans, and Strategies in Pakistan—Implications for the China–Pakistan Economic Corridor Plan." *Environmental Management* 67, no. 5 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00267-021-01449-y>.
- Wardhani, Novea Elysa. "Existence of Fatwa of the National Sharia Council of the Indonesian Ulema Council (DSN-MUI) No. 108/DSN-MUI/X/2016 Concerning Guidelines for Organizing Tourism Based on Sharia Principles: Between Spiritual and Regulatory." *Journal of Social Research* 2, no. 9 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.55324/josr.v2i9.1373>.
- Woodrow, Lindy. "Writing the Literature Review." In *Doing a Master's*

Dissertation in TESOL and Applied Linguistics, 2019.
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429504068-10>.

Yahya, Sulaiman, and Shaizatulaqma Kamalul Ariffin. "Influencing Factors Of 7ps On Consumer Purchase Intention Of Halal Tourism In Kano-Nigeria." *BIMP-EAGA Journal for Sustainable Tourism Development* 10, no. 1 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.51200/bimpeagajtsd.v10i1.3621>.

Yusuf, Muhammad Yasir, Inayatillah Djakfar, Isnaliana, and Hafiih Maulana. "Halal Tourism to Promote Community's Economic Growth: A Model for Aceh, Indonesia." *Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 29, no. 4 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.47836/pjssh.29.4.42>.